Implementation Open Bidding for Middle Managers (JPT Pratama) Position in The National Archives of The Republic of Indonesia (ANRI)

Mita Restu Permatasari, Eko Prasojo
Master of Public Administration, University of Indonesia, Depok, Indonesia
Email: mita.restu@ui.ac.id

Abstract

Indonesia is one of the countries that has carried out personnel reform by implementing open recruitment and selection for Primary High Leadership Positions (JPT) which are currently being carried out openly using a merit system. The National Archives of the Republic of Indonesia as a non-ministerial government institution has also implemented this policy in conducting open recruitment and selection by implementing a merit system. The purpose of this study is to analyze how the implementation of and problems with policy implementation in filling recruitment and open selection for Primary High Leadership Positions (JPT) in personnel management in Indonesia, especially in the National Archives of the Republic of Indonesia. The research method in this paper is qualitative using a post-positivism approach. Data obtained through observation obtained from journals, documentation and interviews were analyzed descriptively in a relevant and accurate manner. The results of the study show that the implementation of the implementation of open selection at the Pratama High Leadership Position (JPT) has not fully gone well so it is necessary to take steps to be able to make strategic improvements in an effort to implement effective bureaucratic reform so that the practice of KKN (Corruption, Collusion and Nepotism) can be avoided. Thus, it is necessary to improve the practice of civil service reform in Indonesia, especially in the implementation of open selection so that it can provide public services in a selective, objective and better supervisory manner based on applicable policies and regulations.

Keywords: High Leadership Positions, Recruitment, Open Selection, Bureaucratic Reform.

Introduction

The current condition of bureaucracy in Indonesia is still faced with the problem of KKN (Corruption, Collusion and Nepotism) which results in administrative of governance not fully running well. The state civil service system in Indonesia before a bill (RUU) of State Civil Apparatus was legalized, it still allowed administrative irregularities as it was in patrimonial bureaucracy which still provided positions for close relatives and relatives. One of government's efforts in bureaucratic reform policies is the enactment of Act No. 5 of 2014 which is concerning State Civil Apparatus (Act Number 5 of 2014). This Act Number 5 of 2014 itself contains changes entirety which is based on the system of merit, transparency and free of intervention both in politics and KKN (Collusion, Corruption and Nepotism).

According to World Economic Forum, World Bank, Transparency International, and Worldwide Governance Indicator quoted in the Indonesian Civil Service Commission (KASN) data source for (in the year of) 2015-2022, Singapore is very superior in various index such as corruption perception, government effectiveness, human development and the global competitiveness index compared to Indonesia. Table 1 shows a comparison of the 2019 index between...
Indonesia and ASEAN countries (Afrianto & Prasojo, 2020).

Table 1
The Comparison of the 2019 Index between Indonesia and ASEAN Countries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Rank</td>
<td>Value</td>
<td>Rank</td>
<td>Value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>54.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Korea Selatan</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>80.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>75.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Filipina</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>51.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Singapura</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>66.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>52.88</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Data of the Indonesian Civil Service Commission (KASN) in 2015-2022 (KASN PPT Material in the Title of Bureaucratic Reform Conditions and Directions)

By looking at the result of the determination of these ranks, it can be concluded that the effectiveness of bureaucratic reform implementation in Indonesia is still far behind from Singapore, South Korea even Malaysia. It can be seen from the level of Corruption Perception Index, Government Effectiveness Index, Human Development Index and Global Competitiveness Index issued for 2019, Indonesia is in the lowest position among those three countries. Some of the notes revealed from this index are that indeed the most problematic factors which occur in Indonesia are corruption and inefficiency in bureaucracy of governance. To minimize those factors, it is necessary to reform bureaucracy especially in the aspect of thinking and culture by increasing the quality of human resources from the bureaucratic organizers itself (Aneja & Xu, 2022).

Responding to the statement above, it is necessary to improve by following the examples and adopting the bureaucratic implementation in Singapore in order to be able to run better, more efficiently, and effectively as well as free from KKN (Corruption, Collusion and Nepotism). That improvement can be started with Civil Servant recruitment system and an open selection recruitment of Primary High Leadership Position (JPT Pratama) which is transparent and place someone in their right position based on competence according to their field. Moreover, the selection process of High Leadership Position (JPT) is regulated in Regulations of the Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucracy Reform Number 15 of 2019 concerning an open and competitive Filling of High Position in the Government Agencies (Permenpan RB Number 15 of 2019). In the process of open selection for High Leadership Position (JPT), it should meet the qualification and the education level which is also supports in carrying out the duties in
their position. So, this process of public position recruitment has to be carried out by Merit System. It is stated in Regulations of the Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucracy Reform Number 40 of 2018 concerning the Guidelines of Merit System in State Civil Apparatus Management. The mechanism of Primary High Leadership Position (JPT Pratama) Filling should be based on qualification, competence and performance in a fair and reasonable manner without differentiating the background of politic, race, skin color, religion, origin, gender, marital status, age or disability (Permenpan RB Number 40 of 2018).

Taking into account these conditions, the National Archives of Republic of Indonesia as a non-ministerial government institution also follows the implementation of open bidding for Primary High Leadership Position for the first time in 2006 as well as carrying out the mandate of State Civil Apparatus (ASN) Act for filling the vacant Primary High Leadership Position (JPT Pratama) by referring to Regulations of the Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucracy Reform Number 13 of 2014 concerning the procedure of Openly Filling High Leadership Position in Government Agencies (Permenpan RB Number 13 of 2014). It surely becomes a big opportunity to implement the bureaucratic reform program in stages by following an open selection stages based on the qualification without involving certain elements of interest. Thus, to support this, it is necessary to have a clear implementation legal basis and independent examiner team to be able to understand the functions and activities of the open bidding.

In the implementation, several open bidding is carried out in the National Archives of Republic of Indonesia until today. There are some problems in the selection system of open bidding which need to be analyzed and evaluated namely selection process does not guarantee the existence of the man in the right place because there are many candidates which are only smart in talking and then they are selected. However, in terms of archiving technical competence, it can be said that their capabilities are limited so that it would be better if the selection is carried out thoroughly both in terms of assessment of leadership and archiving technique especially for Primary High Leadership Position (JPT Pratama) for archive (Substantive).

Actually, broadly speaking the concept of JPT (open bidding) is a good thing as it is according to State Civil Apparatus (ASN) system based on merit system. However, in the implementation, the requirements for being a Primary High Leadership Position (JPT Pratama) in the National Archive of Republic of Indonesia should be those who have experience or have worked in the field of archives in a certain period of time and at least have attended Level II Leadership Training (PIM Training). With these requirements, there is a tendency to close the possibility from private and state-owned enterprise (BUMN) sectors to be able to join the stages of the selection and recruitments. Therefore, open bidding for this JPT gives the impression only for Civil Servant. Since the given requirements are quite difficult so that the applicants often do not meet the specified number. As a result, there are many employees which are from internal of the National Archive of Republic of Indonesia (ANRI) were forced to take part in the selection only for meeting the available quota.

On the other hand, the factor of like and dislike are still very dominant in ANRI so that the assessment of the test results from examiners is still very possible to be manipulated according to the wishes of the leaders. With those problems as stated above, the actual practice of bureaucratic reform has been started well but in the implementation, the efforts in carrying out this bureaucratic
reform is still entering a transitional period which is then encountered with various obstacles and problems resulting in a dilemmatic application of bureaucracy (Armstrong & Taylor, 2020).

The mindset and culture of bureaucracy have also only slightly changed. It can be seen that there are still many practices of KKN (Corruption, Collusion and Nepotism) occurring in the course of transition of civil service bureaucratic reform in Indonesia. Based on those matters, it is necessary to carry out a research which aims to analyze the implementation and problems of open selection of primary high leadership position (JPT Pratama) in the National Archive of Republic of Indonesia. A research of open selection for the filling of primary high leadership position (JPT Pratama) has indeed carried out quite a lot, but the problem faced by some agencies such as Ministry/Institution both central and regional in carrying out the practice of civil service bureaucratic reform is surely differently. Therefore, it is important to conduct the research to assess whether the open selection recruitment bureaucratic reform for filling the primary high leadership position (JPT pratama) in the National Archive has been successfully implemented. Second, as a reference for stakeholders in carrying out the open selection recruitment for filling the primary high leadership position (JPT pratama) in the future. If the application of the opening and selection is considered good, it can be kept and continued even better. However, if the process of implementing open selection application in the Primary High Leadership Position (JPT Pratama) has not fully run well, it should be able to take steps in making strategic improvements for decision makers in an effort to implement bureaucratic reform to support good governance so that it can run effectively so that the practice of KKN (Corruption, Collusion and Nepotism) can be avoided (Janenova & Knox, 2019).

Method

Research approach according to Creswell in Nasution (1998) is is as follows “A research plan and process from general statements to detailed methods of data collection, analysis, and interpretation. The design involves a number of decisions about the stages and tools used to research a particular topic. The research approach has a very important function to help researchers achieve their research objectives”. (Nasution, 1998:5).

This research used descriptive qualitative method with a literature study approach to gain understanding of the focus of research object based on the implementation of open selection recruitment program of primary high leadership position (JPT pratama) in the National Archive of Republic of Indonesia. The literature study was a data collection technique by reviewing books and literature, observation, documentation studies and interviews with the officials of HRM Bureau of the National Archive of Republic of Indonesia which was then analyzed based on facts, theoretical journal, related laws and regulations, regulations in the internal organization and relevant literature study to the research.

Result and Discussions

The existence of Act of Republic of Indonesia Number 5 of 2014 concerning State Civil Apparatus actually opens up the greater space to realizing the system in civil service policy and management in terms of open recruitment and selection. The existence of open bidding especially for this Primary High Leadership Position is to select apparatus who have the ability, skills and integrity to fill a certain position in order to carry out their duties effectively and efficiently. This open selection, of course becomes one way to minimize the potential of corruption, collusion and nepotism (KKN) (McCourt, 2007).
The Implementation of filling high leadership position openly refers to Regulations of the Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucracy Reform Number 13 of 2014 concerning the procedure of Openly Filling High Leadership Position in Government Agencies so the National Archive as non-ministerial government agency which oversees the archives will carry out open selection in filling the Primary High Leadership Position as announced by the selection committee through open announcement by applying merit system according to the predetermined terms and procedures. This JPT selection is also regulated in Regulations of the Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucracy Reform Number 15 of 2019 concerning Openly Filling High Leadership Position in Government Agencies (Permenpan RB Number 15 of 2019).

According to the indicators quoted in Indonesian Civil Service Commission (KASN) data source in 2015-2022, the presentation of merit system implementation in filling out JPT in government agency have always experienced an increase in each year. The following is a graph index of its implementation (Nawawi, 2018):

In the graphic data mentioned above, it can be concluded that in general the government agencies both Ministry/Institution, LPNK and Province/District as a whole have applied compliance in implementing policies in filling out High Leadership Position (JPT) based on merit system which has always experienced an increase with good predicate in each year. So, in this case, the National Archive as non-ministerial government agency which oversees the archives also wants to carry out the open selection in filling the Primary High Leadership Position as announced by selection committee through open announcement by applying merit system according to the predetermined terms and procedures. This process consists of announcing the vacant position, selecting and evaluating administrative track records, assessing competence of technical field of archives, assessing managerial and socio-cultural competence, assessment of writing and presentation of paper and interviews for screening the selection candidates (Yakubu et al., 2022).

The mechanism for filling the primary JPT carried out in the National Archive of Republic of Indonesia can be done in two ways namely Transfer and Open Selection. Based on the Regulations of the National Archive of Republic of Indonesia Number 8 of 2018 concerning Guidelines of Filling the High Leadership Position through Transfer within the National Archive of Republic of Indonesia, filling the vacant primary JPT...
which can be carried out through transfer from one JPT to another JPT within one and between agencies through competency test from the available officials. Based on 2022 data, here is the number of filling in fulfilling the needs of Primary High Leadership Position (JPT Pratama) in the National Archive of Republic of Indonesia:

Table 2
Filling of Fulfilling the Needs of Primary JPT in the National Archive of Republic of Indonesia

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PRIMARY JPT</th>
<th>WORK UNIT</th>
<th>OPEN SELECTION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Head of Planning and Public Relations Bureau</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Director of Archive Resources and Certification</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Director of Processing</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Director of Regional Archive II</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Director of Service and Utilization</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Head of Archive Service Center</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Head of Presidential Static Archive Study Center</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HIGH LEADERSHIP POSITION</th>
<th>TRANSFER</th>
<th>OPEN SELECTION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PRIMARY JPT</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Data was obtained from website of ANRI. www.anri.go.id which was proceed directly by the writer.

By looking at the supporting data mentioned above, in general the National Archive of Republic of Indonesia has applied merit system in implementing the selection of High Leadership Position (JPT) in its environment. However, in practice there are several problems that occur as follows:
1. In the implementation of open selection of merit system application can still be defeated by spoil system approach such as proximity or other political factors. In the end, JPT selection did not fully look at the competence of State Civil Apparatus (ASN) because the results of the predetermined rankings do not guarantee to be selected in the selection.
2. Control over the operation of open bidding such as appraiser and supervisory teams has still not fully functioned properly, so it is still possible to manipulate in the name of political interest.
3. The role of the Head in this case is also very dominating that it is often that in opening this selection, the entrusted candidates from other institutions who are then included in the top three to be appointed as primary JPT even though in terms of competence and managerial are
still lacking, as a result the selection made becomes in vain as the ones who are selected do not meet the requirements and harms other participants who indeed meet the requirements.

Seeing various cases of problems faced in the process of recruitment and open selection of primary JPT, Indonesia should be mirrored from neighborhood country namely Singapore. Singapore is one of countries which can maintain integrity of bureaucratic and meritocracy that is free from KKN (Corruption, Collusion, and Nepotism). The problems about political interest in recruitment and selection of JPT in Indonesia are still problems that often occur in central and regional government. Therefore, the government needs to give attention and improvement to recruitment and selection system of JPT based on competence and free from the influence of political interest so that it can produce the qualified state apparatus (Repucci, 2014).

**The Role of Merit System for Open Selection Primary JPT in ANRI**

The implementation of filling the high leadership position refers to the Regulation of the Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform Number 13 of 2014 concerning the Procedure of Openly Filling High Leadership Position in Government Agencies, the National Archive of Republic of Indonesia as non-ministerial government institution also carries out selection openly in filling Primary High Leadership Position. So, it has met the criteria in Regulation of the Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform Number 40 of 2018 concerning guidelines of merit system which indicates that ANRI has applied ASN merit system in carrying out open selection and promotion. It is also supported by the theory. According to McNamee and Miller, Bellows (Mau et al., 2020) merit system should be built based on individual competence, not based on the factor of kinship or other social backgrounds. Merit system is also defined as mechanism of justice and requires a person to be evaluated based on abilities, knowledge, and skills. Thus, the government uses merit system to ensure that positions in a state bureaucracy are filled by the employees who meet the requirements of skills and expertise in order to professionalism, integrity, and neutrality can be implemented so that the principle of good governance can be realized well.

Merit system application in open selection implementation of primary JPT has not been carried out optimally because there are still some lacks which need to be improved together by all government institutions especially the National Archive of Republic of Indonesia. Those lacks first lies in the principles of good governance that refers to the theory from McNamee and Miller, Bellows’ opinion (Mau et al., 2020) namely competence, skill and eliminating the elements of kinship and other social backgrounds become the main things in merit system application. However, in practice, merit system application can still be defeated by spoil system approach such as proximity or other political factors. With the implementation of this open bidding, qualification and competence should be the main things. In the end, this leads to its own criticism that the JPT election does not fully look at the ASN competence as the State Civil Apparatus who took part in open selection and succeed in having first rank can still be defeated by second and third ranks from the selection result. It clearly happened in ANRI in which the role of leader in terms of like and dislike becomes a consideration to be appointed without prioritizing their competence. In the end the application of recruitment and open selection seems to be only a formality to fulfill the requirements and selection process does not guarantee the existence of the man in the right place (Turner et al., 2022).
Second, political factor. In the application of State Civil Apparatus merit system is required to be neutral and not influenced by political intervention. It also refers to the theory stated by (Ulfa et al., 2020) that merit system is used to fight bureaucracy which is full of nepotistic behavior and spoils system in filling the public position. The goal is to protect bureaucracy in order to have organic-adaptive, harmonious, political, neutral, and public service-oriented character. However, in reality the problems come from internal factors. The employees in the scope of internal ANRI do not seem to have interest in participating the recruitment and open selection because the facts are not in accordance with the concept of neutrality such as the entrusted candidates from other institutions to be included in the top three in open selection recruitment for Primary High Leadership Position (JPT pratama) even though in terms of competence and managerial are still lacking. Thus, political interest and nepotism remain the main consideration for someone to be appointed as Primary High Leadership Position (JPT pratama).

Third, the problems in terms of discrimination towards the requirements stated in holder of primary high leadership position (JPT pratama). In that requirements, several things are determined. One of them is being a JPT in the National Archive of Republic of Indonesia should have experiences in working at the field of archives in certain period of time and minimum they have attended Level II Leadership Training. These requirements are good in one way but there are some lacks which is limiting a certain group who has the expected competence. With the administrative requirements which are very specific, of course, it becomes a limitation for the participants who participate in open selection for primary high leadership position (JPT pratama). If it is seen from the requirements, it is indeed closed the possibility from private and state-owned enterprises sector to follow the steps and recruitment selection.

By seeing the description above, it can be said that to fill the primary high leadership position (JPT pratama) especially in the National Archive of Republic of Indonesia has started to apply merit system even though there are still some lacks and weaknesses as stated above. It surely becomes crucial thing when compared to several best practice in developed countries especially Singapore and South Korea that political factor and nepotism are not as big as in Indonesia which is very dominant and vulnerable to that matter.

Conclusion

Based on the result of analysis by looking at various problems related to the Implementation of Open Selection for Primary High Leadership Position in the National of Archive of Republic of Indonesia, it can be concluded that the current focus of reform lies in the administration. HR in this case is the main thing to highlight. Besides, performance and competence should also be emphasized more so that the people who take part in open bidding are the chosen ones who have competence in the field which is being open bidden. For now, in general civil service reform in Indonesia is trying to make changes in civil service management system thoroughly, started from the system of planning, procurement, career development/promotion, payroll, and the system and limitation of retirement age based on the Act Number 5 of 2014 concerning State Civil Apparatus through merit system prioritizes the principles of professionalism/competency, qualification, performance, transparency, objectivity and free from political intervention and KKN. The main target of the Act of ASN itself is to realize bureaucracy which is professional,
competent, integrated and providing the best service for the people. However, in the implementation of filling Primary JPT in the National Archive of Republic of Indonesia there are still several things need to be improved and perfected. First, merit system application has not fully applied according to the criteria in the Regulations of Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform PermenPAN RB Number 40 of 2018. This should be take full of attention so that it can be improved together in order to the good governance application can be carried out properly. Second, there are obstacles in merit system application in terms of technical and managerial competence. And the last, political intervention is still very vulnerable to occur so that the political interests and nepotism have to minimized and eliminated as much as possible for the requirements to participate in open selection does not seem to limit and discriminate to certain participants.

Reference


